

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

Niaz Muhammad

Abstract

Governance and ethno-nationalism has been closely interlinked in context of Pakistan. A strong central government endowed with all powers and authority to subdue the provincial governments has given birth to the politics of regionalism and ethno-nationalism. The peripheral elite have strongly resisted the highly centralized pattern of governance. They have developed a strong counter-narrative to mobilize the marginalized ethnic groups. The ability of peripheral elites to politicize social, economic and cultural fault lines has hampered the creation of an integrated and coherent nation. It has prolonged the life span of ethnic politics for a period of seventy years. The advent of modern means of communication and the rapidly changing political environment has provided a fertile ground for the proliferation of nationalist sentiments. In this paper it has been argued that media and Pashtun Protection Movement or Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement (PTM) has enabled the Pashtun intelligentsia to shape the face of Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism. They have provided a platform and a means of communication for transmitting message to mobilize the masses.

Keywords: Governance, Ethno-Nationalism, Intelligentsia, Counter-Narrative, Marginalization

Introduction

Governance has been defined as *“the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country’s economic and social resources for development”*. In Pakistan there are two theories of governance i.e. ruling elite theory and the counter elite theory of governance. The former emphasizes on a centralized pattern of governance while the latter on decentralization of political power with maximum provincial autonomy. In Pakistan a centralized pattern of governance has been adopted to forge a unified nation of the variegated ethnic groups. This approach has been resisted by the peripheral elite which gave birth to the politics of regionalism and ethnicity. The intensity of ethnic politics has with alterations in national and regional geo-politics. In case of Pashtun ethno-nationalism the centrifugal forces has waxed and waned with changes in political milieu. Currently, massive displacement of population, migration to cosmopolitan cities and the breakdown of traditional economic system has exacerbated centrifugal forces. Additionally, international media and Pashtun Protection Movement or Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement (PTM) has enabled intelligentsia to arouse nationalist sentiments by mobilizing people. PTM has provided the organizational structure which is a prerequisite for ethnic movement. International media particularly Pashto services of Voice of America (VOA) has enabled the

*Author is M. Phil Scholar, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore

intelligentsia to convey their message without any censorship to previously inaccessible areas.

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism

Some scholars have put forward a comprehensive and concise definition of governance. They define it as “*the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country’s economic and social resources for development*”. In other words, they equate good governance with sound socio-economic development. In general governance refers to the process of exercising political, economic and administrative authority in all spheres of life to improve living standards. It’s a continuous process where public desires are satisfied through a spirit of tolerance and co-existence. The whole edifice of governance stands on the concept of mutual co-operation for public good (Ismail and Rizvi, 2014). Pakistan has been home to diverse ethnic groups. At the time of inception, a highly centralized form of governance has been adopted by the founding fathers to cement the diverse ethnic groups into a coherent whole. Some of the regimes have endeavored to build a unified nation through decrees and fiats which have proved infructuous. Nation-building has remained an unresolved puzzle in Pakistan. Thinking of Pakistan to become a Western-style democracy in near future is a day-dream (Rashid, 2010). The state structure and policy orientation has been contested which has impaired the legitimacy of the ruling elites. There have been two theories about governance pattern in Pakistan. The first is the theory of strong central government which is put forward by the ruling elite. They want a strong central government endowed with all powers and authority to subdue the provincial governments. This theory views political competition as inimical to national integration and public tranquility. The prevailing perceptions have been to control the centrifugal forces and to promote the centripetal forces. The other theory has been put forward by the regional counter-elite. They view centralized governance pattern as inimical to national integration and harmony. Advocating a working federalism, they stand for sufficient provincial autonomy and power decentralization. In their opinion mutual trust and political stability are the prerequisite for national unity and integration (Syed, 1980).

In Pakistan both these practices remained in vogue simultaneously. The ruling elite, preferring a strong center, focuses more on sovereignty and security ignoring basic needs and service-sector. On the other hand the counter-elites have appealed to nationalist sentiments and politics of regionalism to get a fair share in power and resources. Opposition to the centralized state-structure dominated by highly organized bureaucracies has given birth to politics of ethnicity and regionalism. The tension between the center and provinces has been viewed as a protest against the state apparatus, not a denial of state structure (Mumtaz, 1999). Consequently, the politics of call-and-response become a norm reflecting the conflict of ideas and ideals. In order to garner political support, the ruling elite favored one region over other. It resulted in uneven socio-economic development. Due to lack of political vision

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

problems like ethnic divisions and social disparities are besetting the state (Newberg, 2014). The nature of peripheral nationalism depends on the integration of central and peripheral elites. The peripheral elites are more involved in nationalist movements where they are not well integrated economically and politically with the central elites. If the ethnic minority is culturally and institutionally confident, the nationalist likely evolve flexible relations with the center (Hargreaves, 2003). Ernest Gellner argues that the existence of nation does not necessarily give birth to nationalism. He believes that nationalism is the result of uneven industrialization. In his opinion, if there are two territories one developed the other undeveloped than there are two possibilities. First, the elites of undeveloped territory migrate to the developed area and integrate with the central elite. This integration is possible if the peripheral elite is integrated having opportunity of upward mobility without being unnoticed. On the other hand, the peripheral elite will express itself in the form of separatist nationalism if the process of integration is hindered. It may occur in cases where the linguistic, religious and cultural differences between the elite are unbridgeable (Hall, 1998).

Over centralization creates feelings of alienation and deprivation in smaller units. It is tantamount to denial of rights at grass root level. Ultimately, the centrifugal forces abate the power of centripetal forces (Ali et al, 2015). In case of Pakistan, the centralized system of governance dominated by small group of political elites proved problematic in a socially, ethnically and religiously diverse society. A large portion of society has been denied participation in decision-making process. The uneven socio-economic development coupled by unfair power distribution gave birth to linguistic, ethnic and regional identities (Hussain and Hussain, 1993). The famous scholar Christophe Jaffrelot argues that the fate of Pashtun ethno-nationalism has largely been determined by internal factors rather than involvement of external actors. He has identified uneven socio-economic development and unfair distribution of political power as the root causes of Pashtun ethno-nationalism. Over centralization creates feelings of relative deprivation which exacerbate centrifugal forces (Jaffrelot, 1998). At the time of Partition Pashtun leaders demanded an independent state of "Pashtunitan". Later, they tacitly dropped the idea of independent state. Instead, they bestirred for achieving provincial autonomy within the federation of Pakistan. The government was suspicious of both Pashtun nationalism and the support that it gained from the Afghan Government (Ghufran, 2009). Carsten Wieland argues that external actors have helped in hardening ethno-nationalist movements to pursue their goal of achieving independent nation-state in Bosnia and Pakistan (Wieland, 2010). That's why the feelings of mistrust and disunity have prevailed between the ruling elite and Pashtun Nationalists.

Defining Intelligentsia

Some scholars believe that nationalism is a reactionary ideology. It is the reaction of elites of an ethnic group against the power holders. In this sense we can say that

nationalism is the brain child of intelligentsia. Before discussing the role of Pashtun intelligentsia in resurgence of Pashtun nationalism, we need to define who is an intellectual. Italian thinker Antonio Gramsci argues that intellectuals are not characterized by their thinking or imaginative power but by the functions which they perform in the society. In this sense an intellectual is a person who actively participates in social, political and economic activities of the society. According to the nature of the functions which they perform Gramsci has divided intellectuals into two types i.e. traditional and organic (Simon, 1991). Hutchinson believes that the power of thought and activity makes a person an intellectual. He says that on the basis of activities which they perform in the society intellectuals are of two types i.e. formulators of ideas and propagators of these ideas. The formers provide historical and cultural foundations for a movement while the later interpret and propagate these ideas among the masses (Hutchinson, 1987). To define intelligentsia for this work the above definitions have been slightly modified. It has been defined as “*A self-aware and self-conscious group of people who politicize an ethnic identity and propagate their ideas to mobilize their co-nationals on the basis of this identity is called intelligentsia*”. It includes all those people who have influence in their neighborhood, community or society. Although, the bulk of intelligentsia consists of educated people but education is not the sole criterion. The uneducated figures having social influence are also counted in intelligentsia.

Zygmunt Bauman says that the principle intellectuals in a society are the legislators. However, in modern times a new species of intellectuals has emerged to which he calls interpreters. The role of these intellectuals has been specified by the structural conditions of a society. He says that intellectuals predict in order to control events. This control implies a complete possession of the means of objective knowledge. Intellectuals have a better access to knowledge that non-intellectuals do not have. The role of intellectuals is opinion building through authoritative statements (Malesevic, 2006). According to Bauman two things are important i.e. access to knowledge or information and the ability to mold public opinion. In case of Pakistan all formal means of communication are state controlled. The private means of communication i.e. print and electronic media has to follow public laws and regulations. So, to develop a counter-narrative the Pashtun Intelligentsia has to rely on alternative means of communication. In this vein, social media and International media has provided the alternative channel to communicate with the masses. Both social media and international media provide a relatively wide space for freedom of thought and expression. Secondly, the government has less control on these means of communication. They do not abide by the state laws as the local media does. Besides, media Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement or Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement (PTM) has played important role in connecting leadership with masses. It has provided the intelligentsia a platform to propagate their message to the masses.

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

Structural Changes

Some structural changes have changed the nature of Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism in recent times. These changes have deep impacts on the political, social and economic life of the people. Occurring in a short span of few years as a result of growing terrorism and extremism in the region, these changes have drastically altered Pashtun politics. The main changes include the massive displacement of population, migration to cosmopolitan cities and the breakdown of traditional economic system.

According to South Asia Terrorism Portal (SATP) approximately 5.3 million people have been displaced in erstwhile FATA and Swat. These people have been displaced as a consequence of counter-terrorism and counter-extremism operation in the Pashtun belt (<https://borgenproject.org>). In the absence of well-formulated laws and policies the issue of Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) resulted in humanitarian crises. Being from backward and poor areas, the Internally Displaced People have been viewed with suspicion and wariness in the host communities. The IDPs faced serious problems in finding shelters and homes (Nicolini, 2014). It created a big governance challenge for the authorities. On the one hand the government has to deal with management and accommodation issues and on the other hand to persuade the host communities to accept the IDPs. The displacement of people in such a huge number altered the social set-up of the Pashtun Society.

The migration of displaced people to cosmopolitan cities from the Pashtun belt has long-lasting impacts on Pashtun Ethnic politics. In cities they got access to digital technology and other modern means of communication. It brought the hitherto scattered Diaspora in contact with each other. It provided a platform to the educated youth to lament their plight. Exposure to the outside world created feelings of marginalization and relative deprivation among the Pashtun youth. It imbibed a new political consciousness in the mind of historically apolitical constituencies (Kakar, 2018). Resultantly, it changed the nature of Pashtun ethno-nationalism. A new leadership of educated youth overshadowed the traditional nationalist leadership. The new leadership demands basic rights and security for the ethnic Pashtuns within the federation of Pakistan. They have galvanized the grievances of Pashtuns through sit-ins and protests. Demanding speedy restoration of peace in the war-hit Pashtun-belt, they have developed a strong and radical counter-narrative (Siddique, 2018).

Last but not least is the breakdown of traditional economic system in Pashtun belt. The war-hit Pashtun belt suffers from economic stagnation. The war resulted in destruction of communication and transportation infrastructure which brought a gradual economic decline in the region (Storai and Idrees, 2018). Consequently, a spike in unemployment rate has been recorded. A large number of people became jobless. Economic development in the region came to a standstill, resulting in inter-state and intra-state movement of people (Tariq, 2011). The unskilled and semi-skilled labor force faced serious employment problems in urban work places. It created a

strong sense of relative deprivation and exploitation among the people. This situation led to the politicization of historically apolitical constituencies.

Formal administrative laws and regulations do not extend to a large swathe of Pashtun belt. It created a governance vacuum. Pakistan for the first time sent its armed forces to the Tribal Areas and Swat. The army has to work in collaboration with Frontier Corps to eliminate terrorist from the region (Nawaz, 2009). The military operations resulted in large displacement of people from the area. The government lacked resources to tackle the IDPs crises adequately. For a country prone to disasters like Pakistan, it was a great challenge to overcome these crises. It direly needed foreign assistance to provide basic needs and services to millions of internally displace people. Lack of resources and expertise resulted in governance, security and law and order challenges (<http://ec.europa.eu>).

The Pashtun nationalist political parties have been on the hit-list of terrorists. The political activities of the nationalist parties came to halt in most parts of the Pashtun belt. They paused all sorts of campaigns and public meetings. For instance, Awami National Party (ANP) lost scores of leaders in terrorist attacks. The suicide bombers hit rallies killing and wounding hundreds of party workers (Ahmed and Hassan, 2018). On October 2, 2008 a suicide bomber attacked Asfandyar Wali Khan, the leader of ANP. Similarly, on October 5, unidentified persons fired rocket launchers at the residence of Amir Haider Khan Hoti. Besides this some prominent party lawmakers including Alam Zeb Khan, Shamsheer Ali Khan, Bashir Bilour, Alam Zeb Omarzai and Haroon Bilour have been killed in militant attacks (<https://www.thenews.com.pk>). Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PkMAP) also lost many leaders and workers in terrorist attacks. On Monday October 1, 2018 District president of PkMAP has been gunned down by unidentified men (<https://www.dawn.com>). In such circumstances the political parties failed to represent the people. They could not address the problems faced by them. Consequently, the problems and issues faced by the Pashtun populace remained unresolved for a long time. It provided a fertile ground for the resurgence of Pashtun Ethno-Natioalism in a new form. These conditions enabled the Pashtun Intelligentsia to develop a strong counter-narrative. They skillfully downplayed the importance of traditional political narrative among the Pashtun masses. Politicizing problems faced by the Pshtuns, they painted the economic and cultural issues with ethnic hues. To mobilize the people, they adroitly conveyed their message to the marginalized Pashtun people. A nation beset by myriad problems positively reacted to the ethnic appeals.

Intelligentsia and Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

Anthony D. Smith argues that nationalism is a complex phenomenon of linking myths of shared past history with present and future history of a nation. Consequently, it could be inferred that national identities are primordial. They have existed since time immemorial. It also means that nationalism is a ubiquitous phenomenon and nations have existed beyond the limits of time and space. Smith says that nationalist in order

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

to reawaken the nation of the dormancy must rejuvenate nationalistic sentiments through myths (Smith, 1991). The intelligentsia politicizes the already existing ethnic identity to achieve political goals. They formulate identity on the basis of horizontal cleavages in a society. They propagate these ideas among the masses to gain social and political power and influence. In this way ethno-nationalism becomes the struggle of ethnic minorities against the ruling elites. For this paper ethno-nationalism has been defined as “*the struggle of the peripheral elite against the ruling elite for power and resources*”. Walker Connor has differentiated between nationalism and patriotism. He says nationalism is the sense of pride which one feels for belonging to a particular ethnic group. On the other hand, patriotism is the sense of pride one feels for belonging to a particular state (Connor, 2003). Historically Pashtun intelligentsia never questioned the creation of Pakistan. At the time of partition some Pashtun leaders favored the creation of an independent state “Pashtunistan”. However, with passage of time the Pashtun community completely integrated in the Federation of Pakistan. In the early 1950s, Pashtun intelligentsia changed their stance and demanded the creation of an autonomous “Pashtunkhwa” province within the Federation of Pakistan (Schfield, 2010). At present the Pashtun intelligentsia has been striving for civil and political rights under the constitution of Pakistan. So we can say that the issue of Pashtun Nationalism has been settled long ago. It is alive in the sense of ethno-nationalism per se. At present the Pashtun intelligentsia wants to preserve rights and privileges guaranteed by the constitution of Pakistan.

John D. Kerkering argues that the understanding of ethnic identity has been grafted to national identity through literary texts. The text is the bearer of modern ethnic identity. He says that the sense of collective identity comes from a shared pattern of thinking (Kerkering, 2003). The cultural relativists argue that all social phenomena are cultural specific. They say that in modern times globalization has dramatic impacts on social political and economic relationships between individuals, groups and nations. Every social phenomenon needs to be studied in the particular context in which it takes place (Wardak, 2003). David Laitin argues that ethnic conflicts are in fact driven by other factors. He believes that the main reasons behind ethnic conflicts are weak governance, economic inequality, political instability and structural conflicts. In his opinion such ethnic conflicts turns into civil war if unsettled for a long time and due to the involvement of large number of population and large terrain (Johnson, 2012).

In the light of the John D. Kerkering argument we can say that the recent resurgence of Pashtun ethno-nationalism is due to the efforts of Pashtun intelligentsia. In the recent times literacy rate has increased among the Pashtuns. On the other hand social media has facilitated the information flow among the intellectuals and masses. For the first time in history Pashtun intellectuals have succeeded in arousing the sentiments of people on such a large scale. In the light of Cultural Relativist arguments, we can say that the resurgence of Pashtun nationalism is due to the ongoing war on terror. The

Pashtun belt remained the battle field of a ferocious and devastating war. It has completely torn the social fabric of the Pashtun society. In this war thousands of people perished and hundreds are missing. The traditional economic system has been broken down. Millions of people have been displaced and thousands of homes have been razed to the ground. That's why, some scholars view the recent resurgence in the peculiar context of War on Terror. They see it as a reaction to the war. In the light of David Laitin argument we can say that Pashtuns have been deliberately kept backward and ignorant. Their social, economic and political development has been ignored to use the area and people for the national interest. The deprivation of Pashtuns has proved as a stimulant of the recent wave of nationalism. In this sense economic factors carry more weight than political factors. According to this view the upsurge of Pashtun Nationalism is the collective Pashtun response to the exploitative policies of the center rather than having any political motivations.

Anthony D. Smith argues that nationalism is basically the ideology of nation rather than a state. It means that nationalism is a sentiment of belonging to a particular nation. It thus becomes an issue of identity not sovereignty or right of self-determination. He says that a nation could preserve its identity and culture within a state home to diverse ethnic groups. For instance Quebec in Canada has preserved their identity without ceding the Canadian Federation. He says that the main difference between cultural and political nationalism is that the former arouse sentiments for the creation of a self-sustaining nation while the latter for an independent state. He says the intellectuals' appeals to the masses by highlighting genuine socio-economic inequalities. They appeal to masses by evoking myths, symbols, signs and memories of the past (Smith, 2009). The Pashtun intelligentsia has strongly appealed to the masses by highlighting the socio-economic plight of the masses. They have depicted the wretched Pashtuns as the victims of state policies of so-called Strategic-Depth. They have projected the prevailing economic inequality and structural deprivation of the people. The main role in this vein has been played by the Pashtun Nationalist Parties like Awami National Party (ANP) and Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PkMAP). The activists of these parties have established a link with masses at grass root level. They serve as an information channel between the intelligentsia and the masses. The task has been facilitated by Facebook and Twitter. Social media pages and groups have thousands of followers connecting scattered people throughout the world. For instance, a popular Facebook page "The Pashtun Times" has more than two hundred thousand followers. J.C. Dingley believes that the success of nationalism is directly proportional to the number of educated intellectuals among that nation. He argues that unemployed educated men arouse nationalist sentiments. They make nationalism a job creating adventure. They romanticize nationalism in order to garner popular support. The real purport behind the idea of an independent state is the opening of job employment opportunities in new state (Dingley, 2008). The number of educated intelligentsia actively participating in

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

politics, have increased many folds in past few years. That's why, identity politics has become a part of public discourse. The intelligentsia has popularized ethnic politics.

The notion of national identity based on the perception of "us" and "them" can become value-laden. One nation's identity promotion can denigrate others identity. This may not be a reality all the time but a potential risk does exist all the time. The famous scholars Evans believe that national identity is evolved through the negation of the identity of others. Nationalists always see their nation as having special virtues, values and qualities which other nations do not possess (Spencer and Wollman, 2002). In case of Pashtun nationalism, there is no sense of megalomania. The Pashtuns do not consider themselves as a superior race like Nazi Germans. They only claim an equal status like others in the comity of nations. They have respect for the identity of all other nations. The Pashtun nationalists believe that considering themselves superior than other nations is racism not nationalism. Racists suffer from xenophobic feelings. On the other hands nationalists believe in the universal equality of all nations.

Proliferating Nationalistic Literature

Stefano Harney argues that unlike developed world the literature in 3rd world has been split. In the literature, particularly novels, there has been no watertight demarcation between private and public life. The writers in the 3rd World have always written literature that intensifies the growth and self-realization of national identity. He says that in an era of neo-colonialism they not only focus on identity but also the chaos found in these societies (Hareny, 2006). Literature has been broadly categorized as prose and poetry. In Pashtun nationalism the role of prose has remained negligible. However, Pashto poetry has dominated the nationalist discourse. The famous poets like Bakht Zada Danish, Saud Bangash, Milatyar and Matee Ullah Turab have cemented the nationalist bonds through their balladry poetry. They have lamented the devastation of Pashtunkhwa by the outsiders. They have depicted the heroism of the legendary figures like Ahmed Shah Abdali, Mir Wais Hotak, Ayab Khan, Faqir of Api, Ajab Khan Afridi, Malalai Maiwand, Bacha Khan and Abdul Samad Achakzai. The Pashto music has played a revolutionary role in keeping the nationalist sentiments alive. The poetry of Rehman Baba, Khusahl Khan Khattak, Ghani Khan and Amir Hamza Shinwari serves as a common heritage. The balladry singers like Sardar Ali Takkar, Karan Khan, Nowsherwan Qalander, Abdullah Maquari and Shaukat Aziz Wazir have galvanized nationalist sentiments among the Pashtuns throughout the world.

John Hutchinson has argued that nationalists need to mythologize themselves as the true representatives of the nation. They need to create fresh myths without obliterating the old ones. They need to magnify their sacrifices against a common enemy. The fresh myths would enable them to hold on the old loyalties. In the recent time some incidents like shooting Malala Yousafzai through her head, Lynching of Mashal Khan by a violent mob at Abdul Wali Khan University and extra-judicial killing of Nazeem

Mehsud have enlivened the moribund Pashtun ethno-nationalism. These events provided new heroes and symbols for rejuvenating nationalist sentiments. These events brought the scattered Pashtun Diaspora on a single platform under the umbrella of Pashtun Protection Movement or Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement (PTM). PTM came to limelight after a sit-in at the National Press Club Islamabad, to protest the killing of Naqeeb Mehsood in staged police encounter by SSP Malir Rao Anwaar. It is a representative non-violent organization of the ethnic Pashtuns. It demands some basic rights for the marginalized Pashtun masses (<https://www.globalvillagespace.com>). PTM has changed the face of traditional Pashtun ethno-politics. It facilitated the task of intelligentsia in many ways. First, it provided an organizational structure to the hitherto scattered masses. Secondly, it made possible large scale face-to-face interaction of the intelligentsia with the masses. Last but not least, it filled the organizational vacuum created in the wake of a spate of terrorism and extremism in Pashtun-belt. It penetrated into the areas where mainstream nationalist political parties have no access due to security threats.

Pashto as a Unifying Force

Benedict Anderson argues that languages have played the most important role in the formation of national identities. He says, with the advent of print capitalism in Europe, books and magazines published in vernacular languages challenged the dominant role of Latin language. As a result, small languages got promoted in various parts of the Europe. These languages created the sense of nationhood among their speakers (Anderson, 1991). John E. Joseph does not agree with Anderson views. Arguing, that Anderson has presented the role of languages in the formation of national identities as a one-sided phenomenon, He has only paid attention to the formation of nations by languages. Joseph argues that actually nation-language nexus is a two way road. He says national identities also shape national languages. In his opinion, this aspect of the language-nation nexus has been missed by Anderson. For him national identities do have profound impacts on national languages (Joseph, 2004). Joshua Shanes believe that papers like *Dos Folk*, *Der folksfraynd* and *the Yidische folkstsaytung* etc survived for barely two or three years but they provided the nationalists a language to convince the Diaspora Jews that they constitute a nation. The concept of Jewish nationalism has been based on the notion that it is the natural extension of Jewish traditions. They convinced people that for the attainment of rights, political activism is essential (Shanes, 2012).

The Pashto language has played a multi-pronged role in the promotion of nationalism. It has served as a common means of communication among Pashtuns. It's a lingua franca in Afghanistan, Khyber Pukhtoonkhwa, ex-FATA and Northern Pashtun dominated parts of Balochistan. It has facilitated the accumulation of a rich literary heritage. Additionally, it has facilitated the task of glorification of Pashtun identity for the uneducated intelligentsia. It has been used for the transmission of ethnic myths from one generation to another. Some of the myths of Pashtun nationalism have been

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

genuine while others are purely fabricated. In the Pashtun belt “*Hujjrah*” serves as a public place or town hall. It has played an important role in keeping alive nationalist sentiments. After, 9/11 the Voice of America (VOA) launched various radio and television channels in Pashto language. The targeted audiences of these channels have been the Pashtuns, living on both sides of the Durand Line. The most famous of these channels are Deewa Radio, Mashaal Radio and Azadi Radio. Besides this BBC Pashto have a large number of listeners in the Pashtun belt. That’s an icing on the cake for the cause of Pashtun ethno-nationalists. On the one hand it provides authentic information to the listeners and on the other it serves the cause of Pashtun nationalism. Due to broadcastings in Pashto language it has been equally popular among uneducated masses. It creates a uniform narrative of Pashtun ethno-nationalism. The targeted audiences of these channels have been the Pashtuns living in various parts of Pakistan.

Conclusion

It has been discussed in this paper that structural changes as a consequence of the counter-extremism and counter-terrorism operations have changed the face of Pashtun ethno-nationalism. The major changes, through which Pashtun people underwent are massive displacement of population, migration to cosmopolitan cities and the breakdown of traditional economic system. These changes provided the conditions necessary for arousing nationalist sentiments. In addition, Pashtun Protection Movement or Pashtun Tahaffuz Movement (PTM) and international media enabled the intelligentsia to develop a strong counter-narrative. In this way at present intelligentsia is playing leading role in shaping the new face of Pashtun ethno-nationalism.

References

- Ismail.Z.H. and Rizvi.S. (2014). “Some issues of governance in Pakistan”, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/237557751_SOME_ISSUES_OF_GOVERNANCE_IN_PAKISTAN_by
- Rashid.A. (2010). “*The Situation in Pakistan*”, Asian Affairs, 41:3 Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, pp.367-380
- Syed.A.H. (1980). “*The idea of a Pakistani nationhood*”, Polity, Vol.12, pp.575-597, Palgrave Macmillan Journals
- Mumtaz.S. (1999). “*Integrating Ethnic Movements in Pakistan*”, The Pakistan Development Review, Vol.38, No.2, pp.207-217
- Newberg.P.R. (2014). “*Governing Pakistan*”, Asian Affairs: An American Review, 41:4, pp.159-171
- Hargreaves.J. (2003). “*Freedom for Catalonia? Catalan Nationalism, Spanish identity and the Barcelona Olympic Games*”, Cambridge University Press, The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
- Hall.J.A. (1998). “*The State of Nation*”, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
- Ali.L.A. (2015). “*Pakistan: Challenges to Democracy, Governance, and National Unity*”, FWU Journal of Social Sciences, Vol.9, No.1, pp.127-133
- Hussain.M. and Hussain.A. (1993). “*Pakistan Problems of Governance*”, Konark Publishers New Delhi, India
- Jaffrelot.C. (1998). “*Interpreting Ethnic Movements in Pakistan*”, The Pakistan Development Review 37:4, Part.1, pp.153-179
- Ghufran.N. (2009). “*Pashtun Ethno-nationalism and the Taliban Insurgency in the North West Frontier Province of Pakistan*”, Asian Survey, Vol.49, No.6, PP.1092-1114
- Wieland.C. (2010). “*Ethnic Conflicts undressed: Patterns of contrast, interests of elites and clientalism of foreign powers in comparative perspective-Bosnia, India, Pakistan*”, National Papers, Vol.29, No.2, pp.207-241
- Simon.R. (1991). “*Gramsci’s Political Thought: An introduction*”, The Electric Book Company Ltd London UK
- Hutchinson..J. (1987). “*The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism: The Gaelic Revival and the Creation of the Irish National State*”, Taylor and Francis Group 2&4 Park Square Milton Park, Abingdon, OX14 4RN, London, UK
- Malesevic.S. (2006). “*Identity as Ideology: Understanding Ethnicity and Nationalism*”, Palgrave Macmillan Press New York
- <https://borgenproject.org/pakistans-idp-problem/>
- Nicolini.A. (2014). “*Internal Displacement in Pakistan: Finding solution*”, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/698522/internal-displacement-in-pakistan-finding-solutions/>

Governance and Ethno-Nationalism: Analyzing role of intelligentsia in shaping Pashtun Ethno-Nationalism

- Kakar.R.U. (2018). “*Pashtun sit-in — a new political awakening?* ”, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1628826/6-pashtun-sit-new-political-awakening/>
- Siddique.A. (2018). “*New Pashtun Dissent Meets Old Coercion Tactics In Pakistan*”, <https://gandhara.rferl.org/a/Pakistan-pashtun-tahafuz-movement-coercion-tactics/29125095.html>
- Storai.Y. and Idrees.M. (2018). “*Internally Displaced Persons; Impacts of the US Drone Strikes and Operation Zarb-i-Azb in FATA*”, Journal of Civil & Legal Sciences, Volume.7, Issue.2, pp.1-6
- Tariq.K. (2011). “*The Social, Political and Economic Effects of the War on Terror: Pakistan 2009 To 2011*”, ISSRA Papers, pp.65-90
- Nawaz.S. (2009). “*The Pakistan Army and its Role in FATA*”, CTC Sentinel, Vol.2, Issue.1, pp.1-3
http://ec.europa.eu/echo/where/asia-and-pacific/pakistan_en
- Ahmed.J. and Hassan.S.R. (2018). “*Pakistan's secular Pashtun party defiant after Taliban bomber kills 20 activists*”, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-pakistan-politics-anp/pakistans-secular-pashtun-party-defiant-after-taliban-bomber-kills-20-activists-idUSKBN1K11U2>
<https://www.thenews.com.pk/archive/print/425130-chronology-of-attacks-on-anp-in-recent-years>
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1436239>
- Smith.A.D (1991). “*National identity*”, Penguin Books Limited
- Connor.W. (2003). “*Ethno-nationalism in the Contemporary World*”, Taylor & Francis Routledge
- Schfield.V. (2010). “*Afghan Frontier: At the crossroads of conflict*”, Tauris Parke Paperbacks
- Kerkering.J.D. (2003). “*The Poetics of Racial and National Identity in Nineteenth Century America literature*”, Cambridge University Press
- Wardak.A. (2003). “*Jirga - A Traditional Mechanism of Conflict Resolution in Afghanistan*”, University of Glamorgan, UK
- Johnson.R. (2012). “*The Afghan way of war: why and how they fight*”, Oxford University Press
- Smith.A.D. (2009). “*Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism A cultural approach*”, Routledge Tailor and Francis group London and New York
- Dingley.J.C. (2008). “*Nationalism, Social theory and Durkheim*”, Palgrave Macmillan Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY.10010
- Spencer.P. and Wollman.H. (2002). “*Nationalism a critical introduction*”, Sage Publications Ltd London UK
- Hraney.S. (2006). “*Nationalism and Identity: Culture and the Imagination in a Caribbean Diaspora*”, University of the West Indies Press Jamaica
<https://www.globalvillagespace.com/what-is-pashtun-tahafuz-movement-and-what-are-its-objectives/>

Niaz Muhammad

Anderson.B. (1991). *“Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism”*, Verso Books Publishing London UK

Joseph.J.E. (2004). *“Language and Identity: National, Ethnic, Religious”*, Palgrave Macmillan New York

Shanes.J. (2012). *“Diaspora Nationalism and Jewish Identity in Habsburg Galicia”*, Cambridge University Press New York